

# *A Manner of Utterance*

**Also by Ian Brinton:**

Dickens's "Great Expectations" (Reader's Guides)  
(London: Continuum, 2007)

Contemporary Poetry: Poets and Poetry since 1990  
(Cambridge Contexts in Literature; Cambridge: Cambridge  
University Press, 2009)

# **A Manner of Utterance**

§

## ***The Poetry of J.H. Prynne***

edited by

**Ian Brinton**

Shearsman Books  
Exeter

Published in the United Kingdom in 2009 by  
Shearsman Books Ltd  
58 Velwell Road,  
Exeter EX4 4LD

ISBN 978-1-84861-042-2 (Hardcover)

ISBN 978-1-84861-043-9 (Paperback)

First Edition

Introduction & compilation copyright © Ian Brinton, 2009.

All essays included in this volume remain copyright © 2009 by their  
authors, except the following:

Ian Brinton, 'his brilliant luminous shade', copyright © 2006, 2009;  
Richard Humphreys, 'Drawing on Prynne' copyright © 2008, 2009;  
Simon Perril, 'Hanging on Your Every Word', copyright © 2002, 2009;  
Keston Sutherland, 'X L Prynne', copyright © 2007, 2009.

The rights of the authors of these essays and of the introduction to be  
identified as the authors thereof have been asserted by them in accordance  
with the Copyrights, Designs and Patents Act of 1988.

All rights reserved.

### **Acknowledgements**

An earlier version of the essay by Richard Humphreys, and its  
accompanying interview with Ian Friend, was published in *On Paper*  
(Brisbane: Andrew Baker, 2008). An earlier version of Keston Sutherland's  
essay previously appeared in *British Poetry 1945–2007*, eds. Robin Purves  
and Sam Ladkin (Prague: Litteraria Pragensia, 2007). Simon Perril's essay  
previously appeared in *Jacket* (2002). Ian Brinton's essay first appeared in  
*PN Review* 171 (2006).

All quotations from the poetry of J.H. Prynne are drawn from *Poems*  
(Bloodaxe Books / Fremantle Arts Centre Press, 2005), are copyright ©  
J.H. Prynne, and are reproduced here by kind permission of the author.

Quotations from other works by J.H. Prynne are likewise copyright ©  
J.H. Prynne and are reproduced here with the author's permission. The  
quote from Tom Raworth on page 15 is copyright © Tom Raworth and is  
reproduced with his permission. The poem 'The Land Below' by Edward

Dorn, collected in Edward Dorn *Collected Poems* (revised edition, Four  
Seasons Press, San Francisco, 1984) is copyright © Edward Dorn, 1964, and  
is excerpted here by kind permission of Jennifer Dunbar, on behalf of the  
author's estate.

Cover: detail from *Star Damage at Home #2* (2007–2008), Indian ink,  
gouache and pen on khadi paper; 23 x 30 cm, by Ian Friend. Copyright ©  
Ian Friend, 2008. Reproduced by permission of the artist.

## CONTENTS

Ian Brinton	
Introduction	7
Ian Brinton	
‘his brilliant luminous shade’	11
David Caddy	
Notes Towards a Preliminary Reading of J.H. Prynne’s <i>Poems</i>	23
Richard Humphreys	
Drawing on Prynne: Tacit Conversations with Ian Friend and his Work	36
Li Zhi-min	
J.H. Prynne’s Poetry and its Relations with Chinese Poetics	51
Rod Mengham	
‘A Free Hand to Refuse Everything’: Politics and Intricacy in the Work of J.H. Prynne	69
Simon Perril	
Hanging on Your Every Word; J.H. Prynne’s ‘Bands Around The Throat’ and a Dialectics of planned impurity	83
Keston Sutherland	
X L Prynne	104
John Douglas Templeton	
Many voices: <i>singing</i>	133
Erik Ulman	
Composing with Prynne	145
Nigel Wheale	
Crosswording. Paths through <i>Red D Gypsum</i>	162



## INTRODUCTION

**Ian Brinton**

*How the poets were the first philosophers, the first astronomers and historiographers and orators and musicians of the world*

Utterance also and language is given by nature to man for persuasion of others and aid of themselves—I mean the first ability to speak. For speech itself is artificial and made by man, and the more pleasing it is the more it prevaileth to such purpose as it is intended for; but speech by metre is a kind of utterance more cleanly couched and more delicate to the ear than prose is, because it is more current and slipper upon the tongue, and withal tuneable and melodious, as a kind of music, and therefore may be termed a musical speech or utterance, which cannot but please the hearer very well. Another cause is for that it is briefer and more compendious, and easier to bear away and be retained in memory, than that which is contained in multitude of words, and full of tedious ambage and long periods. It is, beside, a manner of utterance more eloquent and rhetorical than the ordinary prose which we use in our daily talk, because it is decked and set out with all manner of fresh colours and figures, which maketh that it sooner inveigleth the judgement of man, and carrieth his opinion this way and that, whither soever the heart, by impression of the ear, shall be most affectionately bent and directed.

George Puttenham, *The Art of English Poesy*, 1589.

This collection of essays by musicians, visual artists, academics and teachers revolves around the notion of what is involved in the activity of reading and, in particular, what effect the reading of the poetry of J.H. Prynne has had upon them. It is not a Reader's Guide; it does not provide answers. Instead it offers personal and deeply felt reactions to reading Prynne's poetry and discovering what Douglas Templeton refers to when he says that for him the poems "put ambiguity in the foreground" where they "achieve an authenticity by acknowledging the dangerous spaces in language."

The book's genesis lay partly in my trying to reconcile within myself the views of two readers whose attitudes towards Prynne's poetry seemed so widely divergent, ranging from the quietly serious to the ludicrous. Randall Stevenson's suggestion in volume 12 of *The*

*Oxford English Literary History* that Prynne's "full significance for the period's poetry began to be realised only at the end of the century" seemed wildly at odds with Don Paterson's comment in an article published in November 2004 in *The Guardian* ('Rhyme and reason'). In the latter it is suggested that readers find whatever they want in their reading: "The Norwich phone book or a set of log tables would serve them as well as their Prynne, in whom they seem able to detect as many shades of mind-blowing confusion as Buddhists do the absolute." The former appears in an academic book which goes some way in charting the literary developments taking place in England between 1960 and 2000, the latter in a daily newspaper; what they share in common is that both say something about the art of reading.

The sense of relationship between the poet and the reader has been intriguingly highlighted in the recently published book by Dr. Li Zhi-min, *New Chinese Poetry under the Influence of Western Poetics: The Origins, Development and Sense of Nateness*:

In the face of difficult poetry, there certainly should be a change of attitude towards 'understanding' itself, so that one can feel confident to understand an 'obscure' poem in an 'obscure' way.

In terms of reading being a lifelong occupation, Li Zhi-min also brings to our attention an attitude of traditional Chinese reading:

Traditionally, Chinese readers often read a good poem again and again, in a loud voice and by murmuring, in imagination and in meditation; in doing so they naturally enjoy the poetical beauties. And sometimes in China one may often memorise a poem one does not understand; only dozens of months or even dozens of years later to experience a sudden enlightenment and full enjoyment of the poem. Poetry is written to be read, not to be analysed.

Prynne himself has said quite a bit about reading, from the generous review of Chris Torrance's 1968 book of poems, *Green Orange Purple*



*Red* (*Grosseteste Review* Autumn 1969) to the more recent ‘Tips on Practical Criticism for Students of English’ and its companion piece, ‘Tips on Reading’, January 2004. In the former he praises Torrance’s “singing voice of such persuasive and dilated movement” which “has not for a long time been heard in the land”, words which might well be attributed to his own singing grace. In reference to ‘Practical Criticism’, a term to describe a Cambridge invention introduced by I.A. Richards in the 1920s, he suggests that “Regular exercises in close reading both sharpen and deepen accurate response to local texture and also feed into enhanced perception of larger-scale structure, to make us all-round better readers.”

Those comments made by Li Zhi-min about traditional Chinese reading suggest a significant amount of trust and willing engagement on the part of the reader and if this were to prompt the question as to what one might read in this trusting way then perhaps we should also note Douglas Templeton’s reaction to his reading of Prynne:

There is something about the voice of these poems which led me to trust the author.

Also referring to that engagement between text and reader, reviewing *Unanswering Rational Shore* (*Poetry Review* Vol. 92, No. 2, Summer 2002) Jeremy Noel-Tod suggested that Prynne’s poetry “will be misunderstood if it is looked at, and not read” and this echoes Veronica Forrest-Thomson’s recognition that Prynne’s poetry sought to “make language real again for the poet and the reader” (*Poetic Artifice*, Manchester University Press, 1978).

In that *Grosseteste* review of nearly forty years ago, Prynne referred to Torrance’s singing voice as being “covert, aware of distance held off by a species of pearly haze, small faces of the actual suddenly but without surprise revealing an intimate curve.” In an echoing image which appears in *The First Students’ English Magazine* printed at Guangzhou University in May 2005, suggesting a fine sense of continuity which is certainly not to be confused with repetition, he recognised the ‘brilliant’ quality of the new magazine which had arisen from the reading involved in the Guangzhou University English Writing Classes “full of pearl-bright moments and shining articles all moving along in the currents of these changing times.”

Perhaps the last word here ought to be given to Jeremy Prynne as a teacher as well as a poet. In his extensive notes of advice, those ‘Tips’ given to students of English, he highlights the central importance of reading in relation to humanity and, in a way, prepares us for the reactions of those contributors whose engagement with the lifetime’s work of this central figure has proved to be the real starting-point for this book:

When a reading of text has proceeded by laborious stages within the test-rig of detailed study, pause to allow the overall effect to integrate back into a coherent human reading, and ponder whether your life may even have been changed, just a little, or your beliefs about large questions; whether your habits of feeling have been flattered or boastfully challenged, or whether your relation to the text builds up a kind of trust. This aspect is what you will take away with you when all the study is finished, and it should last you through a lifetime.