What’s Working & What’s Not in Data Sharing across Multiple Agencies

Tim Giles
Fresno Regional Workforce Development Board
@WDB_Fresno

Scott Secamiglio
Kentucky Stats
@kystats

Annelise Grimm
Code for America
@ItsAnnelise

Matt Gee
BrightHive
@brighthiveio
What’s Working and What’s Not
In Data Sharing Across Multiple Agencies

❖ Introduction

➢ Tim Giles – From the local perspective, what hasn’t worked.

➢ Scott Secamiglio– From the state perspective, what has worked.

➢ Annelise Grimm – From the user perspective, how data can support user-centered design processes for the workforce system.

➢ Matt Gee – From the national perspective, data for the American dream.
Tim Giles
Fresno Regional Workforce Development Board
What’s Not Working

❖ Where we were – WIA Implementation

➢ July 1, 2000 – No State System in place to facilitate common intake/case management (CICM) or Universal Service Tracking.

➢ Local Areas on their own.

■ Various areas have different resources available.

■ Multiple vendors offering solutions.

■ Costs borne by locals.
What’s Not Working

➢ Fresno County

■ Struggled with CICM that didn’t work.

■ Vendor overwhelmed.

■ Tracked visitors with paper forms and Microsoft Access database.

■ Re-procured and purchased license for I-Train by California Municipal Technologies Inc. in 2003.

■ Used I-Train as a customized system that met local needs.
What's Not Working

❖ Meanwhile, at the State

➢ Changes made to the existing data collection system, Job Training Automation System (JTA) for WIA.
  ■ This consisted of separate databases for each local.
  ■ Some areas had local instances of JTA database and transferred data monthly.

➢ Feasibility study to determine path to new system.

➢ New system chosen over 10 years after WIA implementation.
  ■ Implementation took 2 years, May 5, 2014, New CalJOBS went live.
What’s Not Working

❖ Local Areas heavily invested in local system.
❖ State was to allow local areas to continue with local systems, loaded data into CalJOBS, thereby sharing data across workforce data collection systems.
❖ However, locals were then mandated to use CalJOBS and load program (API) no longer supported and to be turned off.
What’s Not Working

❖ Breakdown of bad behavior

➢ Lack of action.
  ■ A decade to decide how to proceed.

➢ Locals not effectively viewed as stakeholders.
  ■ No concrete inclusion of local areas in needs assessment resulting in a system severely lacking in local needs.

➢ Heavy hand.
  ■ Forcing locals to take actions that are detrimental to local customer service, procedures, and reporting requirements.
What’s Not Working

❖ Lessons Learned?

➢ Active Referrals.
  ■ History repeating.

➢ Strategic Co-enrollment.
  ■ Slow moving but discussions are better.

➢ Limiting Technology.
Scott Secamiglio
Kentucky Stats
Kentucky Center for Statistics

Uniting our data
Informing our Commonwealth

February 2019
Why does KYstats exist?
We believe that strong connections between educators and employers will produce a more prosperous Commonwealth.
We connect data from educators and employers to inform our Commonwealth.
Kentucky Longitudinal Data System (KLDS) Powered by KYSTATS

In-progress relationships
- Department of Workforce Investment - Apprenticeships
- Department of Workforce Investment - Focus
- Kentucky Transportation Cabinet - Driver Licensing
- Kentucky Chamber of Commerce - Talent Pipeline Management
- National Institute for Automotive Service Excellence (ASE)
- Computing Technology Industry Association (CompTIA)
WIOA Program Evaluation
KYSTATS Workforce Dashboards
WORK READY COMMUNITIES

State Overview

Distribution of Communities by Number of Criteria Met

- Meets 1 Cr.
- Meets 2 Cr.
- Meets 3 Cr.
- Meets 4 Cr.
- Meets All

Community Criteria Status for Fayette

The five criteria highlighted here require a specific metric to be met to qualify as a “Meets Criteria” or “Does Not Meet Criteria.” The thresholds can be found by hovering over any metric or info icon. Though these five criteria are the only currently defined metrics, they are not the only criteria that are under consideration for the program. Some criteria include an exception rule, which you can learn more about on the Work Ready Community’s website.

- Meets Criteria
- Does Not Meet Criteria

Required Criteria

- Internet Availability and Speed: 100%
- High School Graduation Rate: 91%
- Some College or Higher Degree: 72%
- Associate Degree or Higher: 44%

Support Information

- Key Sector Demand for UDA (2017-2021)
- Certification Status
- Workforce Participation Rate
- Working Age Population (18-64)
- Without a High School Diploma: 9%
Work Ready Communities

County Profile

1. Select a Community ->

2. The previous dashboard shows whether or not a community, as a whole, meets all of the work-ready criteria. This map explores deeper and takes a look at census tracts within each county to investigate at a more granular level.

3. To gain perspective for the most of the metrics below, take a look at the total population for this community. The total population is broken down into the working age population (those 16 to 64 years of age), the veteran population, and those living in poverty.

4. Next, what are some economic factors of the community? The first is workforce participation rate. It measures the percentage of the working age population who are in the labor force (those with a job or actively looking for a job). This number also excludes those incarcerated or otherwise institutionalized. The second is unemployment rate, which measures the percentage within the labor force that is currently without a job and is not seasonally adjusted. Last, the median household income is presented.

5. What are health outcomes of this community? The first is an overall health score, which measures length and quality of life relative to other counties in Kentucky. The second, teen pregnancy rate, is the teen birth rate for females ages 15 to 19. Finally, obesity rate, is defined as the percent of adults that report a body mass index of 30 or more.

Additional Resources

6. Want additional resources for your community? Clicking on any of the boxes will take you to specialized reports in that topic area. The topics below include outcomes for high school graduates, postsecondary graduates, those affected by the 1115 Medicaid Waive, offending patterns, GED earners, and career center contact info. For even more information, go to [Kentucky Career Center].
Eligible Training Provider Feedback Report
The Eligible Training Provider Feedback Report is an interactive report that assists policymakers, practitioners and the public when making education and workforce decisions. The Eligible Training Provider Feedback Report utilizes two components of education and workforce development in Kentucky: Eligible Training Provider Served and Completion Data and Current Employment Outcomes. Eligible Training Provider Served and Completion Data displays the most current program data available by total number of people attending and completing a training program. Future Workforce Demand uses a combination of Kentucky Labor Market Information.
Projected Occupation Demand

Select an occupation to see the projected 5 year employment demand, employed totals, average wage and projected growth in the map. The table below will display those institutions with training programs for those occupations and the latest ETPL report card scores for each.

2016 ETPL Programs for Demand Occupations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution Name</th>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Completion Rate</th>
<th>Employed in 2nd Qtr after Exit Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alice Lloyd College</td>
<td>Accounting and Business/Management</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Biology/Biological Sciences, General</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Business/Commerce, General</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elementary Education and Teaching</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>English Language and Literature, General</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates this data has been redacted. The Kentucky Center for Statistics follows strict redaction and suppression guidelines to ensure the privacy of all students.
Our data are only the beginning of the conversation.
Want to learn more?

kystats.ky.gov
@kystats
Scott Secamiglio
Senior Research Analyst
Scott.Secamiglio@ky.gov
Annelise Grimm
Code for America
Code for America is a nonprofit organization that partners with governments to strengthen the delivery of public services through user-centered technology.
Our theory of change

Show what’s possible
Government services so good they inspire change

Transforming government services

Help others do it
Principles and practices that make change real

Build a movement
A learning community that makes change stick
User-Centered Design

Build

Make something small to meet people’s needs

Learn

Collect feedback about what works and what doesn’t

Measure

Observe people using what you made
Showing what’s possible

**Workforce Development**
Increase the number of people who have a living-wage job

**Criminal Justice**
Clear every eligible record through automatic record clearance.

**Safety Net Services**
Close the SNAP participation gap
Build human-centered eligibility / enrollment experience to apply for benefits online
Raise the floor & Build ladders
We explored 3 workforce pain point areas

**Wraparound Services**
Barriers to employment often stand between job seekers and success getting and keeping a job. Services to address those barriers are limited.

**Paid Training**
Job seekers and low-wage workers typically can’t forgo income in order to participate in training or search for a better paying job.

**Outcomes Accountability**
Decision-makers do not have sufficient information about which elements of the workforce system are working well, and which are not.
Prototyping
User testing in CA, CO, and NJ
findtraining.org

Leveraging integrated data to solve real user problems
“I get one shot at this. If it doesn’t work I can’t try again.”
What is the user problem?

- **Job seekers struggle to choose the right training opportunity.** They need to find not just the *best* training program, but the best training program *for them*, whatever their individual needs may be.

- **Job seekers sometimes pick suboptimal training programs** because marketing is powerful, and helpful information is hard to find, inaccessible, or off-limits.

- **Many job seekers must navigate this key decision-point on their own.** Only a small percentage of job seekers will have a case manager that can help them find a training program.
What is the system problem?

- In most cases, the workforce **system doesn’t have enough information** to know which training programs lead to quality jobs.

- **Decision-makers don’t have real-time feedback loops**, and are often using outdated information.

  “I’m using labor market information from 2009”

  “We provide services, but then we don’t know what happens”
How might we help clients make informed decisions about training, and find and enroll in the best training for them?
Assumption: a better, more intuitive presentation of training program information (including outcomes and available support services), would increase the number of job seekers who find and enroll in a quality training program, and would help job seekers enroll in better trainings, faster.
NJ has amazing data!
This is how New Jersey job seekers are currently searching for training opportunities.
Mobile friendly, outcomes-oriented, and user centered.
Creating a feedback loop to improve service delivery

- Users: 1,537
  - New Users: 1,520
- Sessions: 1,705
- Number of Sessions per User: 1.11
- Pageviews: 5,114
  - Pages / Session: 3.00
  - Avg. Session Duration: 00:01:41
  - Bounce Rate: 50.21%

Popular Search Terms
- medical/health/...: 303 (14.6%)
- computer/softw/...: 211 (10.2%)
- education/teach/...: 104 (5.0%)
- business/manager/...: 90 (4.3%)
- sales/marketing: 52 (2.5%)

Popular Filters
- In-demand: 397 (21.7%)
- Other Language/...: 345 (18.8%)
- On-Site Childcare/...: 327 (17.8%)
- Distance Learning/...: 314 (17.1%)
- Spanish-Speaking/...: 198 (10.8%)
- Career Counselor/...: 100 (5.5%)
Collect feedback about what works and what doesn’t.

Make something small to meet people’s needs.

Observe people using what you made.
User-centered design helps us stay focused on what the user really needs, and motivates us to find ways to overcome system challenges.
Why does it matter? Will findtraining.org...

- Increase utilization of a core workforce benefit, Individual Training Accounts ($2-7k), as well as other state and local funding streams?
- Measurably increase wages by driving people to higher quality programs?
- Create a feedback loop for the workforce system re what supports job seekers need?
- Drive resources to the programs that are producing the best outcomes, boosting their capacity to serve more people?
Recommendations for workforce leaders

- **Invest in a state longitudinal data system** to better understand the **outcomes of different workforce efforts**, and surface key data points (graduation rates, job placement, retention, wage growth over time) to job seekers, workforce boards, and state leaders.

- **Keep labor market information up-to-date**, and make this information easily available and understandable to job seekers, case managers, and workforce boards.

- **Increase funds** available to job seekers to subsidize participation in quality training programs, and **invest in wraparound supports**. We learned that navigation is important, but funding and supports also have to be in place in order for someone to be able to participate in training.
Findtraining.org is completely open source - check it out!

http://findtraining.org
https://github.com/codeforamerica/etpl-search
“Where should I go to get a good burger nearby?”

Jeremy, 17

“Where should I go to get a good job nearby?”
Where’s the missing data for mapping and navigating opportunity?
Critical data exists, but is locked away in siloed systems.

- **Built for compliance not impact**
- **Siloed systems *stifle* ROI**
- **Data owners underinvesting in innovation**
What does it take to unlock the value of opportunity data for low income Americans?
What does it take to unlock the value of opportunity data for low income Americans?

The Right Conditions

The Right Coalition

Workers

Education & Training Providers

State & Government Agencies

Employers
The Right Conditions

✓ Identified need precipitated by a moment of crisis in the region

✓ Unifying vision for how to address this need through public-private collaboration

✓ Local testbed(s) for quick experimentation and demonstrating early wins

✓ State leadership in governor’s office, lead agency to support & drive initiative forward

✓ Enabling legislation providing potential for ongoing authority and sustained funding

✓ Supportive state or national advocacy driving individual-centered use case

✓ Enabling technical standards & ethical norms to create necessary connections & new uses

✓ Shifting market incentives driving old & new platforms toward adoption and use of open data
The Right Coalition

The Coalition Leader
Trusted org for local testbed engagement & coordination
Seed funding

The Tech & Data Nerds
Data governance
Open Source Infrastructure

Minimum Viable Coalition
of Data Partners, Service Providers, & Application Partners

The Operator
Project management, stakeholder engagement & communications

User Research & Engagement
Understand needs & concerns of target population
Californians can use their phones to map a journey to any destination in the world, yet the path to a family sustaining job remains elusive for many. Project Signal connects the digital dots necessary to map every Californian's path to prosperity.

January 2019

A partnership led by:

Bay Area Workforce Funders Collaborative  PATH  brighthive  entangled.studios
What does it take to unlock the value of state data for low income Californians?
What does it take to unlock the value of this data for low income Californians?
What does it take to unlock the value of this data for low income Californians?
What does it take to unlock the value of this data for low income Californians?

Education & Training Providers

Workers

Employers

JEREMY’S FIVE
Act 1: Setting the Stage

- Education & Training Providers
- State & Government Agencies
- Employers
- Workers

Scope out the Conditions

Form the Coalition
Identified Need
2MM “working poor” Californians lack essential career answers

- What jobs are available in my region?
- What skills and credentials do I need to get those jobs?
- What training programs can I attend to get those skills and credentials?
- What financial aid do I qualify for?
- What career opportunities & earnings can I expect from these programs?
Identified Need

Crisis and Opportunity in California

✓ Stagnating wages cost Californians $BN/yr

✓ Unprecedented divide between rich and poor in Bay Area

✓ Leverage Silicon Valley to fuel social sector innovation

✓ Mobile connectivity enables 99%+ worker coverage

✓ Statewide momentum supporting pathways & longitudinal data
**Unifying Vision:** California’s data needs to be connected, public, & person-centered

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connected</th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Person-centered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Links between datasets power intelligent applications</td>
<td>Training and employment data securely available in machine-readable format</td>
<td>Designed to serve individuals and families</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Unifying Vision
Imagine a future where...

Education & Training Providers
can track graduate wage gains and ROI

State & Government Agencies
can safely share data and track outcomes

Workers
can use public data to make informed decisions about training and employment

Employers
gain restored confidence in education and training programs
**Unifying Vision**

Project Signal unlocks the value of data to generate impact

- **Workers** use reliable data to connect with training providers and employers
- **Service Providers** connect and serve new populations
- **App developers** create new ways to reach job seekers
- **Project Signal data trust** aggregates & secures data
- **Data Partners** gain insight to inform policy and investment

- K-12
- Higher Ed
- Gov't agencies
# Local testbeds

**Project Signal Bay Area & LA pilots aim to demonstrate three uses of data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Search, Discovery &amp; Exploration</th>
<th>Deliver career information for to inform high ROI decisions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Measure Outcomes</td>
<td>Track wage gains for specific career pathways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Enhance Access to Social Services</td>
<td>Provide a digital onramp to training &amp; social services resources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**State leadership, enabling legislation, & state advocacy**
Unique moment to shape the future of data infrastructure in the state

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
<td>Governor’s office priority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senior policy advisor for cradle to career success tasked with developing and executing on a statewide data plan based on regional successes in 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
<td>$10 million proposed budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proposed for state longitudinal data system that serves individuals in their education and career journeys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
<td>EDGE coalition and NSC leading policy advocacy at state house</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Working with legislators to influence and craft legislation to support data infrastructure as a permanent public asset</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Enabling Technical Standards

One line of code unlocks new insights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Python</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><code>import requests</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><code>url = &quot;https://tpot-ctp-api.herokuapp.com/v0/outcome/4/7890&quot;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><code>response = requests.request(&quot;GET&quot;, url)</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><code>print(response.text)</code></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

```json
[
  {
    "provider_name": "Turner Institute",
    "provider_id": 4,
    "provider_type": 7,
    "program_type": 8,
    "program_cip": 7890,
    "reporting_period": 2015,
    "all_served": 112,
    "allExited": 79,
    "wioa_served": 111,
    "wioa_exited": 74,
    "wioa_ita_served": 109,
    "wioa_ita_exited": 41,
    "all_completed": 49,
    "wioa_completed": 51,
    "all_employed_2q": 83,
    "all_employed_4q": 82,
    "all_median_earnings": 51699,
    "all_earned_36": 36,
    "wioa_earned_36": 30,
    "nonwioa_employed_2q": 4,
    "nonwioa_employed_4q": 2,
    "nonwioa_median_earnings": 14594,
    "nonwioa_earned_36": 1,
    "nonwioa_earned_36": 3,
    "cost_per_wioa_participant": 19889
  }
]
```

### Service population

- `all_served`
- `allExited`
- `wioa_served`
- `wioa_exited`
- `wioa_ita_served`
- `wioa_ita_exited`
- `all_completed`
- `wioa_completed`

### Longitudinal data

- `all_employed_2q`
- `all_employed_4q`
- `all_median_earnings`
- `all_earned_36`
- `wioa_earned_36`
- `nonwioa_earned_36`

### Wage data

- `nonwioa_earned_36`
- `nonwioa_earned_36`

### ROI data

- `cost_per_wioa_participant`
Guiding ethical principles

● Fairness
  a. Understand, mitigate and communicate the presence of bias in both data practice and consumption.

● Benefit
  a. Set people before data and be responsible for maximizing social benefit and minimizing harm.

● Openness
  a. Practice humility and openness. Transparent practices, community engagement, and responsible communications are an integral part of data ethics.

● Reliability
  a. Ensure that every effort is made to glean a complete understanding of what is contained within data, where it came from, and how it was created. Extend this effort for future users of all data and derivative data.
Shifting market incentives for platforms to use open data to reach millions of low income users
What does it take to unlock the value of opportunity data for low income Americans?

**The Right Conditions**

- Education & Training Providers
- State & Government Agencies
- Employers
- Workers

**The Right Coalition**
The Right Coalition

The Coalition Leader
Trusted org for local testbed engagement & coordination
Seed funding

The Tech & Data Nerds
Data governance
Open Source Infrastructure

The Operator
Project management, stakeholder engagement & communications

Minimum Viable Coalition
of Data Partners, Service Providers, & Application Partners

User Research & Engagement
Understand needs & concerns of target population
Ex: The Project Signal Coalition

The Coalition Leader
Trusted org for local testbed engagement & coordination
Seed funding

The Operator
Project management, stakeholder engagement & communications

The Tech & Data Nerds
Data governance
Open Source Infrastructure

User Research & Engagement
Understand needs & concerns of target population
### Measuring Success: What does success look like?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target Impact Metrics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>● 2MM 24-65 year old “working poor” Californians = total addressable local market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● 800,000 unemployed Californians = specific addressable market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● 25,000 workers engaged through training providers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● 5,000 workers placed in training programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● 2,000 workers placed in living wage jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Increased 12+ month job placement retention</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
California isn’t the only place that is ready

The Right Conditions

The Right Coalition

JEREMY’S FIVE
The problem and opportunity facing California is also relevant for other regions around the country. How can we find the next Project Signal?
Reminder: data collaboratives, like Project Signal, enable public and private data to be pooled in an ethical, incentive-compatible way.

- **Workers** can use public data to make informed decisions about training and employment.
- **Education & Training Providers** can track graduate wage gains and ROI.
- **State & Government Agencies** can safely share data and track outcomes.
- **Employers** gain restored confidence in education and training programs.
THEORY OF CHANGE

Risk capital can play a catalytic role in bringing together the right stakeholders to collect and expose data in order to help the most in need workers.

PURPOSE

Surface the next few pilots like Project Signal by identifying those states and sub-state regions which are ready to take the next step.

GOAL

Identify and launch three pilots to build data trusts that promote a more open, connected, and linked information environment for workers.
Core RFP activities are intentionally designed to mitigate potential risks

New ideas and efforts from local coalitions
Surfaces new ideas and efforts that local coalitions would like to implement

Early wins
Frontloads the screening for who is capable of implementing a data trust by testing their ability to bring together coalitions

Milestones and proof of support
Provides a process to drive implementation by requiring milestones and proof of support by required stakeholders

Data privacy concerns
Mission/scope creep from target populations
Sustainability
Each collaborative receiving a grant must reach four milestones as a condition of receiving the grant

- **At least one end use of the new opportunity data** that aims to improve opportunity for low-income populations

- **At least one complete opportunity dataset** within twelve months of the formation of the data collaborative and new or existing open data policies to publish the data via an open API

- State-level **data collaborative** that includes public and private actors with the mission of creating new opportunity datasets

- State-level **opportunity data policy and action plan** that aligns with state open-data policy and state interagency data-sharing policies
Near-term and longer-term outcomes that provide solutions to a larger population and generate broader momentum to enable scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 | Adoption and use of pilot  
Newly available data should see adoption and use by vendors and entrepreneurs providing solutions to a broader population of end users with each state |
| 2 | Additional use cases  
Successful sites should have additional use cases that enable applications for each opportunity dataset that don’t require any direct funding |
| 3 | Value of data collaboratives  
Successful pilots will provide examples of functional data collaboratives for other states and the federal government to easily build on and replicate |
Lead organization will help guide grantees through the main phases of collective action in this initiative

**Phase 1**
Preparation and RFP Development
*Dec’18 – Mar’19*

**Phase 2**
RFP Process
*Apr’19 – Jun’19*

**Phase 2**
Pilot Implementation
*Jul’19 – Aug’21*

**Phase 4**
Evaluation, Learning, and Scaling
*Aug’21 -*
What’s Working & What’s Not in Data Sharing across Multiple Agencies

Q&A
What’s Working & What’s Not in Data Sharing across Multiple Agencies

Thank You!